

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
AT CHARLESTON**

<b>IN RE ETHICON, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327</b>  <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:  ETHICON WAVE 4 CASES</b>	

**NOTICE OF ADOPTION OF DEFENDANTS' PRIOR DAUBERT REPLY  
IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN  
GENERAL OPINIONS OF ALAN GARELY, M.D. FOR WAVE 4**

Plaintiffs filed a Notice of Adoption (ECF No. 3720) in Ethicon Wave 4, Case No. 2:12-md-02327, adopting their Response in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude Certain Opinions of Alan Garely, M.D., ECF No. 2202 ("Plaintiffs' Wave 1 Response"). Defendants hereby adopt and incorporate by reference their prior Reply Memorandum in Ethicon Wave 1, ECF No. 2286, filed in further support of their Motion to Exclude Certain Opinions of Alan Garely, M.D., ECF No. 2128 ("Defendants' Wave 1 Motion").

Defendants acknowledge that on September 1, 2016, the Court issued a Memorandum Opinion and Order, ECF No. 2718 (the "Order"), GRANTING Defendants' Wave 1 Motion in part, DENYING it in part, and RESERVING judgment in part.

Where the Court GRANTED Defendants' Wave 1 Motion, Defendants respectfully request that the Court adopt the same ruling in the Wave 4 Cases for the reasons set forth in the Court's Order.

With respect to Defendants' motion to exclude Dr. Garely's opinions on degradation, the Court DENIED Defendants' Wave 1 Motion as moot because Plaintiffs conceded that Dr. Garely will not offer any opinions about mesh degradation. (See Order, p. 8). In their Wave 4 Opposition, ECF No. 3720, Plaintiffs have adopted their Wave 1 Response and have not offered any new opinions about mesh degradation by Dr. Garely. Accordingly, the Court's Wave 1 ruling should apply.

Where the Court otherwise DENIED or RESERVED judgment on Defendants' Wave 1 Motion, Defendants acknowledge the Court's ruling, and acknowledge the same circumstances apply in Wave 4, but preserve their right to challenge the ruling on appeal.

May 4, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4523  
christy.jones@butlersnow.com

/s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W.Va. Bar #3731)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338  
(304) 414-1807  
dthomas@tcspllc.com

/s/ Kelly S. Crawford

Kelly S. Crawford  
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland &  
Perretti, LLP  
Headquarters Plaza  
One Speedwell Avenue  
Morristown, NJ 07962-1981  
(973) 451-8417  
kcrawford@riker.com

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS  
ETHICON, INC., ETHICON, LLC, AND  
JOHNSON & JOHNSON

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 4, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the court using CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Kelly S. Crawford

Kelly S. Crawford